

CONSTITUTION OF TECHNICAL COMMITTEE TO MONITOR THE DATA PROCESSING STEPS FOR 6TH POPULATION AND HOUSING CENSUS-2017

It is informed that the Government of Sindh (**annexed at “A”**) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (**annexed at “B”**) had raised some apprehensions regarding transparency of the process of data processing regarding 6th population and housing census. In order to address the said apprehensions, the Minister for Finance, Revenue, Economic Affairs, Statistics and Privatization had proposed on 14th March, 2017 (**annexed at “C”**) that a Committee of Technical Experts nominated by provincial government may be constituted to Monitor the data processing at PBS headquarters and to ensure that all parameters of data processing are being uniformly applied for the entire country.

In this connection the Government of Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Sindh, Balochistan & FATA have constituted their Technical Committee for the said purpose (Annex-1,2,3,4,5). These committees have visited PBS headquarters Islamabad, they were given detailed presentation on the data processing steps and they were also showed the Census store and data processing center.

Details of Technical Committees Meetings

Sr.No	Provinces	1st Meeting	2nd Meeting
1.	Punjab	30-05-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared	06-09-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared
2.	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	21-05-2017 Record note/minutes were not prepared	10-10-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared
3.	Sindh	31-05-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared	22-09-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared
4.	Balochistan	02-11-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared	Nil
5.	FATA	21-11-2017 Record note/minutes were prepared	Nil

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF PUNJAB PROVINCE (1st Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Point
<p>First meeting held on 30th May, 2017</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minister enquired about the counting of Pathans /Afghans in the census process. <p>The committee gave following suggestions for consideration while planning for the next Census.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Training to field staff may be given six days instead of four days. b) The limit of reserve staff may be enhanced to 15% of 10%. c) In urban areas field staff may also be taken, from other nation building department in addition to Education Department alone. d) A gap of 3 to 4 days between House Listing Operation and Census enumeration may be observed to have cushion for coverage of big size blocks. e) To explore, the possibility of conducting census on electronic devices in future. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chief Census Commissioner clarified that according to UN-Convention all persons living in a country in a specified time will be counted irrespective of their nationality or any legal status; if a person does not have a CNIC even then he will be counted.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF PUNJAB PROVINCE (2nd Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
Second meeting held on 6th September, 2017	<p>Minister for Mines & Minerals Punjab (Ch. Sher Ali Khan) Chairman of the Committee <u>appreciated the hard work done by PBS,</u> Provincial Government, District Government and <u>Army</u>. He further informed that they are <u>satisfied with the methodology adopted for data collection, editing and data processing of Census 2017.</u> Punjab Government <u>fully supports the Provisional Results</u> although their share has gone down but they will accept the results of Census 2017. All other provinces should rely on these figures.</p>	

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
PROVINCE (1st Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
First meeting (21st May, 2017)	First meeting of Technical Committee was held on 21 st May, 2017 but the Minutes of the meeting were not prepared. Dr. Muhammad Iqbal, member of Sub-Committee of Governing Council informed during the 9 th meeting of Governing Council regarding Technical Committee of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The minutes of meeting of Committee were not prepared. Doctor Muhammad Iqbal member of Sub-Committee informed during the meeting of Sub-Committee of Governing Council dated 7th July, 2017 (Minutes are annexed at "D") that he had interaction with the members of the Technical Sub-Committee of GC formed by the Government of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa who visited PBS and saw the protocols being adopted in Data Processing and scanning of REN-2 forms. The Technical Committee showed their satisfaction for the work done at PBS headquarter Islamabad.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA
PROVINCE (2nd Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
<p>Second meeting(10th October, 2017)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chairman Technical Committee informed that he has seen the district level data released by PBS. He further said that MPA (Haji Abdul Haq Khan) advisor to Chief Minister Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and his team are also attending the meeting regarding their reservations/concerns pertaining to Census 2017 results released by PBS for Kohistan district in Census-2017. • Representative of Kohistan informed that total population of Pattan tehsil should be at-least 6 lakh. • Chairman suggested that is if it is possible to recount the people of Pattan tehsil the same process may be reported for the satisfaction of these peoples. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At the time of compilation of the provisional results of Census-2017, abnormal increase in population / growth rate was observed while processing the census data pertaining to Kohistan district. The matter was brought into the notice of 9th meeting of Sub-Committee/ Technical Committee of Governing Council and it was decided to adjust the population of Kohistan District of Census-2017 (Minutes of meeting are annexed at “D”). • PBS is working on Kohistan District regarding final results of Census-2017 are in approval stage and the grievances of the applicants will be redressed at the time of releasing of final results of Census-2017 after approval of the CCI. • It is a policy decision and action can be taken after consultation as PBS has to adopt uniform policy for all the Provinces/stakeholders.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF SINDH PROVINCE(1st Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
<p>First meeting (31st May, 2017)</p>	<p>Minister enquire that why cannot they have a carbon copy of their own family information and can they check their information to ensure that it has been entered correctly or otherwise.</p> <p>Suggestions: -</p> <p>Chairman of the Committee suggested that government of Sindh is ready to provide Data Entry Operator / Supervisors at data processing stage to ensure that all parameters are equally applied to all the provinces and for the sake of ownership of data entry of their province.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Chief Census Commissioner informed that 53 million forms were got printed in the year 2007 and provision of carbon copy of such huge quantity is arduous job with no benefit. • He further informed that individual information cannot be shared with other departments and provision of carbon copy of individual information gathered during census process is <u>against the UN Convention/Recommendations (at “E”)and General Statistics (Re-organization) Act-2011 under Section 28, Secrecy of answers, information and returns (at “F”)</u>. • It was also clarified that verification of family tree from NADRA has been served as deterrence tool, and only 6.5 million CNICs were checked on random basis. • Chief Census Commissioner informed that uniform policy will be applied for each federating unit. It was decided that Government of Sindh may write a letter to this effect to PBS. Such suggestion will be forwarded to other provinces for consideration, after that such practice will be adopted with the concurrence of other stakeholders or otherwise.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF SINDH PROVINCE(2nd Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/Discussed	PBS View Points
<p>Second meeting (22nd September, 2017)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Chairman of the Committee informed that Sindh Government is not satisfied with the Census Operation carried out during Census-2017 with specific reference to house listing. • The Chairman of the Committee mentioned that Sindh government had requested for provision of copy of Form-2 for record of the provincial government. He further mentioned that Provincial Government has 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Census has been conducted using staff of Provincial Governments and monitoring / Vigilance Teams & other Operational Committees were headed by Chief Secretaries/Commissioners/Deputy Commissioners. • In order to lend credibility to the census process and to provide the security to census field staff, a uniform soldier was deployed with each civil enumerator and data of total number of persons was cross checked at the end of the day by both civilian/army personnel to ensure complete coverage and to avoid errors/omissions. • The committee was informed that filled-in Census documents have been received under the security cover of Armed Forms to prevent any untoward incidents • PBS has scanned the REN Forms received from concerned provincial field staff of all provinces and presented before the Technical Committee of Sindh. Detail

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/Discussed	PBS View Points
	<p>not taken on board while preparing the results.</p> <p>The Committee members while supporting their proposals were also insisting for copies of REN-2 and block maps alongwith coordinates they said that they are in need for more informed decision so that they may be able to verify the figures collected there in and they can satisfy their people about the accuracy of data.</p>	<p>scanned REN Forms of Sindh were shown to Committee along with entry in database to present the case that whenever the data has been provided by the enumerator (Provincial field staff) entered in the database and no change has been made.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PBS informed that it never remained practice in the past five Censuses `carried out in the country. • It is informed that it is a policy decision and the matter will be discussed with the Minister and other stakeholders. Further action can be taken after consultation as PBS has to adopt uniform policy for all the Provinces / stakeholders. Copies of Form-2 cannot be shared under PBS Law.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF BALOCHISTAN PROVINCE
(1st Meeting)

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
<p>First meeting (2nd November, 2017)</p>	<p>It was inquired that whether CNIC was mandatory in the census process or not?</p> <p>The results of Awaran and Kech districts were questioned by the Agha Syed Liaqat Ali, MPA, Member of the Committee and asked that have PBS done any home work for such issue?</p> <p>Why PBS made more blocks in Kech without approval of the provincial cabinet?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Committee was informed that it was not mandatory. All families/individuals residing in the country during Census reference day have been counted in the Census, irrespective of the fact that they had CNIC or not. • It was informed that more number of blocks were reported during Census operation. The issue was referred back to the Census District Officer/DC for justification. Accordingly the issue was discussed by the Deputy Commissioner Kech and Southern Commands. The Committee was informed about the methodology and process of Census Operation and show all the data received from field enumerators. • It was clarified that PBS constituted the Census Blocks strictly following the notified boundaries of the urban/rural areas issued by respective provincial government departments. Formation of blocks within the Mauzas and Urban Areas is the mandate of PBS. Hence there is no need for approval of provincial cabinet.

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
	<p>Why the time of field operation was extended in Kech?</p> <p>Whether the persons with blocked CNIC have not been counted in the census operation?</p> <p>Honourable member Agha Syed Liaqat Ali, MPA further mentioned that Kech is a sensitive area and insurgency is in place, then how we believe that PBS has done census in that area successfully. The growth rate during census 1998 was 0.50, whereas it has gone upto 4.23% in Kech district which is not believable. He further informed that mining areas of Balochistan Province have not been covered in Qila Abdullah, Muslim Bagh and Pashin districts.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It was informed that census in Kech and Awaran was conducted during two phases due to less number of local levies /police staff available for census duty. • All families / individuals residing in the country during Census reference day have been counted in the Census, irrespective of the fact that they had CNIC or not. • All the areas of Provinces were covered completely by civil enumerator with the help of Armed personnel. At the end of the day the data of total number of persons were cross checked by civilian enumerators with Armed Forces enumerators. No complaint regarding left over areas were received during Census Operation.

TECHNICAL COMMITTEE OF FATA

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
<p>First meeting (23rd November, 2017)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Political Agent informed that Orakzai Agency consists of two tehsils called Upper Orakzai and Lower Orakzai where counting of population is less in number. He specifically informed that Lower Orakzai Tehsil data shows acceptable growth in population whereas population growth of Upper Orakzai is on lower side due to boycott of the residents of the areas. • The residents of FATA living in different parts of the country due to law & order situation of the area may be adjusted in the population of FATA. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PBS clarified that efforts were made to enumerate all the families living in FATA during census operation and it was ensured that nobody is left out. • The main reason for less population of FATA is that there is a trend of out migration and shifting of the population of FATA to various parts of the country for better education, basic facilities, business and jobs / service etc. and till the time of Census not gone back to FATA. • It was decided in a meeting held with SAFRON that IDPs will be adjusted in the population of FATA by acquiring the CNICs data from NADRA and FDMA and the same will be adjusted in the final results of Census-2017. • In the Consultative meeting of Experts, Senior Officers of PBS and Consultant on Census from UNFPA dated 12th May, 2018, it was decided that TDPs population may be counted in the areas where they were residing at the time of Census Operation and may not be

Date of Meeting	Main points Raised/ Discussed	PBS View Points
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • He further informed that there are more than one hundred thousand Mamuzai tribes whose population has not been counted properly. There are two areas namely Ghilgo and Dohari consisting of about 12 villages whose population could not be counted as they were living in Kohat and Hangu areas. 	<p>shifted to their respective Agencies. (Minutes of the meeting are enclosed).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PBS tried its best that no person of FATA should remain uncounted during Census Operation 2017. • The process of Listing of buildings and enumeration of population in FATA was done by the local staff which was cross checked with the database for accuracy of data.